Call to Order:
Chairman Fred Guthier called the virtual meeting to order at 3:00 PM. He welcomed those in attendance and explained the procedures for the meeting. The minutes of the March 5th, 2020 meeting were approved unanimously. The agenda for the May 7th, 2020 meeting was unanimously accepted. All affidavits were received and no conflicts of interest were cited. Lonnerstater called out to the public to gather names for public comment.

Old Business:

A. CA 19-875
Application by Donald Broughman for a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for replacement windows located at 404 PETTIGRU ST. (TM# 004500-01-00500).

Lonnerstater presented the application for window replacement at 404 Pettigru St., located in the Pettigru Preservation Overlay District. The applicant proposes to replace five historic wood windows on the sunroom addition with vinyl windows. Lonnerstater explained staff’s recommendation of denial due to inconsistency with the design guidelines.

Property owner Ron Chism presented photographs from nearby properties that feature vinyl windows.

No one from the public spoke in favor or against the application.

Alison Tucker asked if the appearance of the home would be strange with both vinyl and wood windows. Matt Tindall responded that it would be difficult to notice the difference, but that the intent is to replace windows in-kind.

Matt Tindall made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Monica Floyd and approved 4-1, with Jermaine Johnson voting no.

New Business:

A. CA 20-132
Application by Tony Smith for a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for a new single-family home located at 0 BUTLER AVE. (TM# 001600-01-01600).
Lonnerstater presented the application for a new single-family home within the Hampton-Pinckney Preservation Overlay District. Lonnerstater explained staff’s recommendation of approval with conditions: Revised plans shall be submitted to staff for final review and approval. The revised plans shall address the following: 1) Provide material selection samples or pictures of the proposed lap-siding and board-and-batten siding. A smooth texture shall be used rather than wood-grain texture; 2) Provide details and material selection for front door, garage door, and porch railing; 3) Incorporate arrowheads along the top of the fence; 4) Provide details of HVAC/mechanical equipment location and potential screening; 5) Compliance with maximum impervious area requirements is the responsibility of the property owner.

Jon Peery, representing the applicant, clarified that the windows are vinyl-clad casement windows. The client prefers simulated-divided-lites on the front of the home, with grid-between-glass on the remainder of the windows.

Aaron Barr, 109 Butler Ave., stated his general support for the project, but mentioned concern regarding maintaining the historic setback pattern.

Matt Tindall stated his opinion that all windows on the home should maintain simulated-divided-lites instead of grid-between-glass. Monica Floyd concurred, and expressed concern over maintaining a common setback line. Fred Guthier stated that the setback requirement appears to have been met. Jay Graham clarified that addressing will assigned at the time of permitting. Lonnerstater clarified that, because the porch is less than 30 inches above grade, the front setback is measured to the face of the house rather than the porch.

Matt Tindall made a motion to approve the application with conditions: Revised plans shall be submitted to staff for final review and approval. The revised plans shall address the following: 1) A smooth texture shall be used for the lap siding rather than wood-grain texture; 2) Replace the “pork-chop” eaves on the front and rear elevations with traditional eave returns; 3) Depict the locations and widths of window shutters; 4) Provide color selection for proposed gable louvers; and 5) Plans for permit submittal shall comply with the common building line setback requirement and will be reviewed by staff at time of permit. The motion was seconded by Monica Floyd and approved 5-0.

B. CA 20-208

Application by Nathan Kaser for a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for a new single-family home located at 20 BALSAM DR. (TM# 019200-01-01301).

Lonnerstater presented the application for a new two-story single-family home within the Overbrook Preservation Overlay District, and outlined staff’s recommendation of approval with conditions: revised plans shall be submitted to, reviewed and approved by staff, addressing the following: 1) A smooth texture shall be used for the lap siding rather than wood-grain texture; 2) Replace the “pork-chop” eaves on the front and rear elevations with traditional eave returns; 3) Depict the locations and widths of window shutters; 4) Provide color selection for proposed gable louvers; and 5) Plans for permit submittal shall comply with the common building line setback requirement and will be reviewed by staff at time of permit.

The applicant, Nathan Kaser, spoke on behalf of the application. Nathan clarified that the window grid is actually 4 over 1. Louver vents will be white to match the lap siding.

No one from the public spoke in favor or against the application.

Matt Tindall recommended that the front columns be historically-accurate; the column width should match the porch beam width. Additionally, the width of the shutters should match the width of the windows, and the second-
story front window should be reduced in size and/or achieve the same grid pattern (4 over 1 double-hung) as the remainder of the home.

Nathan Kaser clarified that the upper story window is casement. The grid pattern can be modified to match the other double-hung windows. Shutters will be left off of the house.

Matt Tindall made a motion to approve the application with conditions: 1) A smooth texture shall be used for the lap siding rather than wood-grain texture; 2) Replace the “pork-chop” eaves on the front and rear elevations with traditional eave returns; 3) Provide color selection for proposed gable louvers; 4) Plans for permit submittal shall comply with the common building line setback requirement and will be reviewed by staff at time of permit; 5) Front columns shall be historically-accurate; 6) No shutters will be shown on the elevations; and 7) the upper-story window on the front façade will have a grid pattern to simulate a double-hung window to match the windows on the first story. Seconded by Monica Floyd, approved 5-0.

Other Business (Not a Public Hearing):
   A. None

Advice and Comment (Not a Public Hearing)
   A. None

Informal Review (Not a Public Hearing):
   A. None

Adjourn:
Having no other business, the meeting adjourned at 4:00 pm.