Members Present: Monica Floyd, Fred Guthier, Matt Tindall, and Allison Tucker
Members Absent: Jermaine Johnson
Staff Present: Jay Graham, Planning and Development Manager, Logan Wells, Assistant City Attorney; Courtney Powell, Senior Development Planner; Matt Lonnerstater, Development Planner; Brennan Williams, Development Planner; Benjamin Abdo, Development Planner; Kris Kurjiaka, Development Planner

Call to Order:
Chairwoman Monica Floyd called the meeting to order at 3:00 PM. She welcomed those in attendance and explained the procedures for the meeting. The minutes of the January 2, 2020 meeting were approved unanimously. The agenda for the February 6, 2020 meeting was unanimously accepted. All affidavits were received and no conflicts of interest were cited.

Old Business:
A. None

New Business:
A. CAS 19-875 Application by Donald Broughman for a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS located at 404 Pettigru St. for replacement windows (TM# 004500-01-00500).

Lonnerstater presented the five (5) proposed vinyl window replacements at the single-family home within the Pettigru Historic Preservation Overlay District. Lonnerstater pointed out the location of the window replacements on the sunroom addition, proposed as 9 over 1 grid. The existing windows are wood, but are proposed to be replaced with vinyl. The application was previously reviewed with two members of the Design Review Board Neighborhood Panel, where it was relayed to the applicant that the windows would need to be replaced in-kind. Lonnerstater explained staff's recommendation of denial.

The property owner, Ron Chism, spoke on behalf of the application and was available to answer questions. The property owner explained that the other windows on the house had previously been replaced with vinyl, and that only two (2) of the subject windows face the public street. The property owner provided to the Board additional photographs of the house and adjacent properties as well as a petition in favor of the modifications signed by adjacent property owners.

No one from the public spoke in favor or against the application.

The Board discussed the precedent that windows be replaced in kind with similar sash patterns, and that historic homes eventually be renovated and rehabilitated to their historic character.

Tindall made a motion to defer the application to a later meeting date to allow the applicant to make the following modifications: 1) Replacement windows shall be wood windows; 2) Replacement windows shall have a simulated divided light grid pattern; and 3) Replacement windows shall have a 9 over 1 sash pattern. The motion was seconded by Fred Guthier and approved 4-0.
Other Business (Not a Public Hearing):

A. RHP 20-16 Application by DP3 Architects (Chase Robinson) for a PRELIMINARY HISTORIC PROPERTIES SPECIAL TAX ASSESSMENT on property located at 1503 E. North St. (TM #019000-02-07000).

Powell presented the requirements and findings for preliminary historic property special tax assessment eligibility: 1) The property must qualify as historic; 2) The rehabilitation shall be appropriate for the historic building; and 3) The minimum expenditures for rehabilitation must exceed 100% of the fair market value of an income-producing property. The property is not located within a listed historic district, but does retain its own historical significance as it is associated with the prominent Woodside Brothers investors.

Powell explained the applicant’s proposal to renovate and rehabilitate the exterior of the existing commercial structure. Powell outlined staff’s initial concerns with the original proposal: 1) Front façade shall not be painted; 2) Original window pattern shall be maintained on the front façade; 3) Brick corner details shall remain wrapping from front façade to side façade; 4) Elevation that fronts Chestnut Street shall address the pedestrian realm; 5) Original coping on the parapet shall be preserved as it is a character-defining feature to the structure; and 6) Brick inset detail on the front façade shall be preserved as it is a character-defining feature to the structure.

Powell explained that the total estimated qualifying rehabilitation expenditures would exceed the fair market value by 100% and outlined staff’s recommendation of approval with conditions.

Chase Robinson (DP3 Architects), applicant, presented a modified design responding to staff’s initial concerns. Robinson addressed landscape buffering adjacent to Chestnut Street. A sidewalk will be installed adjacent to Chestnut Street.

The Board discussed the modified design’s consistency with staff’s recommendations.

Fred Guthier made a motion to approve the application with modifications that respond to staff comments. The motion was seconded by Matt Tindall and approved 4-0.

Advice and Comment (Not a Public Hearing)

A. None

Informal Review (Not a Public Hearing):

A. None

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair

A. Chair

Allison Tucker nominated Fred Guthier as CHAIR, who accepted. The Panel approved Fred Guthier as CHAIR.

B. Vice-Chair

Fred Guthier nominated Matt Tindall as VICE-CHAIR, who accepted. The Panel approved Matt Tindall as VICE-CHAIR.

Adjourn:

Having no other business, the meeting adjourned at 3:43 pm.